

**Village of Walden  
Board of Trustees Regular Meeting  
September 5, 2017**

Mayor Rumbold called the regular meeting of the Village of Walden Board of Trustees to order at 6:30pm.

On roll call the following were:

Present:	Mayor	Sue Rumbold
	Deputy Mayor	Sean T. Hoffman
	Trustees	Brenda Adams
		Faith Moore
		John Ramos
		Brian B. Sebring
		Lynn E. Thompson

Absent:

Also Present:	John Revella, Village Manager
	Tara Bliss, Village Clerk
	Dave Donovan, Village Attorney

**Village Manager's Report**

- We had a few water main breaks, large ones, in the area of Ivy Hill Road and Northern Avenue and a valve as well on Ulster Avenue on a few different dates.
- Made some progress at the new DPW building still waiting on NYSEG to put the panel up. We had a phone conference with them today and urged them to help us. In the meantime, DPW is preparing roads to be paved in the next few weeks: Kelmour Street, Grandview Avenue, Millard Avenue, and Wait Street. They are doing catch basins to prepare.
- Sidewalks on Wait Street have been finished.
- Had a good meeting with our Insurance agent reviewing the limits in policies and our audit report.
- Reviewed some work flow issues with the Parks Department with seasonal staffing tapering off the last few weeks.
- Grants with Lanc and Tully including the EFC funding for Sewer system.
- Summer Youth Employment Program graduation was wonderful.
- Our 2 new part time Police Officers have finished their training. Have asked for the County list which we found out is now available for Full Time Officer so we should be able to fill the 3 open positions we have.
- The Rehab loans that are ongoing are moving forward pretty well.
- Attended a shared services meeting to work on what we can do to comply with states request and to try to get funding to help in that endeavor.
- Orange County Transportation Council meeting worked on planning and policies in regards to the western half of OC and the transportation study for that half. Hopefully with the study data they have for the other half they can put together some plans for overall transportation in the County.

- Met with the Building Inspector about some code enforcement issues he is following up with the judge and some other matters that the Code Enforcement Officer is working on. They are inundated with permits so they are trying to even out the work flow.
- We helped get all the back packs ready for the August 26<sup>th</sup> give away event.
- Attended a meeting at the Walden Dam on Bradley Avenue regarding their re-permitting for their hydroelectric plant. It was just an informational session, not much to do on our end. We were the original permittee and is up for renewal in 2022 but the process needs to be started now with the DEC.

Trustee Adams asked if the sprinkler issue at the Thruway plaza is resolved.

Manager Revella replied there was not much we can do about it on private property. It's installed properly except for the entrance wire.

Trustee Adams asked about 90 West Main Street

Manager Revella replied that is a litigation matter at this time.

Trustee Adams asked for a status update on Ulster Avenue sidewalk project.

Manager Revella replied that we finished the letters for the state today actually.

Deputy Mayor Hoffman asked for more information about the DPW building he understood we were waiting for NYSEG, do we have an estimated date it will be done.

Manager Revella replied, no. We have been working with them for 4 months to get this panel up. They had a meeting with them while he was away and they said it was going to be a week, which didn't happen. So we called again today to push them. The local guys are trying to help as much as they can but they are bound by the work orders they get from the regional office. If we don't hear back by Friday we will have another conference call with the regional office.

### **Approval of August 8, 2017 Minutes**

Trustee Adams made a motion to approve the August 8, 2017 minutes. Seconded by Trustee Ramos. All ayes. Motion carried.

### **Trustee's Committee Reports**

#### **DPW Liaison– Trustee Sebring**

Trustee Sebring reported that he has been away all weekend and didn't get to talk to Fred, but from his report, DPW has been moving along with the HVAC and electrical work at DPW building, plumbing too. Been out sweeping streets. Been rebuilding catch basins and had 3 water main breaks on Ivy Hill Road and Ulster Ave valve. They installed 14 new meters at the Water Department.

#### **Recreation & Parks Department and Valley Central School Board Liaison – Trustee Ramos**

Trustee Ramos reported that school started today. There were a few hiccups with transportation issues getting kids back and forth but East End reassured him they will just

be growing pains and should be resolved in the near future. School Board did a great job keeping everyone notified but there were many families waiting between 45 minutes to an hour. Hopefully will work on improving that. We had a banner year for Parks and Recs summer program was wonderful. Fall soccer numbers are a little low but will likely pop up as school starts.

#### **Police Department and Justice Department Liaison – Deputy Mayor Hoffman**

Deputy Mayor Hoffman reported that he talked to Sgt. Metzger while Chief was away the last few weeks. The larger items they spoke about were the County list for hires that the Manager already talked about. Other items were the status of the cars that were just received which seems to be still on schedule. Before Chief went away we had a meeting with the Orange County Human Rights Department head which went well and we have a follow up meeting tomorrow. It was more of an introductory meeting but seems to be moving well.

#### **Village Offices Liaison – Trustee Adams**

Trustee Adams reported that aside from what was in the reports for the Clerk and Treasurer the independent audit is going on with Nugent and Haeussler. She has sent a few emails to Kelly but has been busy with the Auditors so we'll get back to that when she is finished with them.

#### **Planning and Zoning Boards as well as the Building Department Liaison – Trustee Moore**

Trustee Moore reported that she met with Dean and discussed the items in his report and spoke about agenda items for the Zoning and Planning Board as well as 90 West Main Street.

#### **Town of Montgomery & Library Board liaison – Trustee Thompson**

Trustee Thompson reported that she met with Mr. Woznick who reported that the rail trail repairs have been delayed until October due to issues they had with drilling. They spoke about another spot on the trail with earth on the trail and they cleared the culvert out and it is taken care of. Hill Street Bridge got approved to get 2 pieces from Tappan Zee Bridge as parts are compatible to fix the bridge which will save a lot of money. The pieces will not be released until March of 2018 so hopefully late spring or early summer they will get the bridge repair going. The Library all the door alarms that were in question are all working now and still doing research on some security systems to link them with existing things we have in place. They have been doing mock drills with the staff. Very excited about a program with the Orange Library Association with a book that everyone is working on called the Underground Railroad and the author is going to come and do a reading in Tuxedo with tickets are available at our library for those that may want to attend. It is September 23<sup>rd</sup> at 3pm.

Mayor Rumbold read the community events into the minutes.

Trustee Moore added that the United Way will be sending supplies for Harvey relief efforts and OC RDAC will be a location for collecting supplies.

Manager Revella stated that there are 2 additional agenda items tonight: F: Revised 2017-2018 Budget - Capital Projects List and G: Resolution 8-17-18 - Budget Adjustment.

## **Public Comment on Business of the Board**

Robert Walther, 5 Gladstone Avenue, wanted to reiterate again that he is objecting to having fluoride in our water. They say that casualties have had a drop here since we have been adding fluoride but they had the same exact drop in Sweden, Britain, France and several other European countries who have not had fluoride in the water. Not sure what the exact cause is but it is not related to the fluoride in the water. It is not to be given to infants and we are doing it now because everyone has the same water and it is not good for them as it is a poison. It's a by-product and is a nasty substance.

## **Action Items**

### **Resolution 6-17-18: 5 Cherry Street**

Manager Revella explained this resolution authorizes our Attorney to draft a contract for the sale of 5 Cherry Street.

Attorney Donovan stated that the property was appraised at \$75,000 have an offer for \$72,500 to American Petroleum and this authorizes him to draft a contract and authorizes the Manager to sign said contract. Legally you are not required to accept the appraised value you are required to get fair value for the property.

Trustee Sebring made the motion to adopt Resolution 6-17-18 – Sale of 5 Cherry Street. Seconded by Trustee Ramos. All ayes. Motion carried

### **Resolution 7-17-18: DASNY Funding**

Manager Revella stated this is for the \$150,000 water front park funding secured by Senator Larkin.

Attorney Donovan explained the Board if so inclined would need to adopt a negative declaration before adopting the resolution.

Trustee Sebring made the motion for Negative Declaration under SEQRA for Resolution 7-17-18: DASNY Funding. Seconded by Trustee Ramos. All ayes. Motion carried.

Trustee Sebring made the motion to adopt Resolution 7-17-18: DASNY Funding. Seconded by Trustee Moore. All ayes. Motion carried

### **Award Bid – Salary Survey**

Manager Revella explained that we received a bid from Pinnacle Human Resources LLC and what we discussed was to go through with the first part of the original deliverables and if we needed additional we would exercise that at that time. The cost is \$5,000. He does not usually do deposits so he will discuss that with them should the bid be awarded.

Trustee Adams added that there are 2 titles missing which was a typing error and she has been told that they are including those titles with no change in price for the 2 Deputies. All the other optional possibilities are based on 12 not on 10.

Manager Revella stated he would get that in writing should the bid be awarded.

Mayor Rumbold has concerns that the reason why we are doing this in the first part or do we see that it's really not going to be that useful unless we add the additional services.

Manager Revella replied that the only thing he can see is to possibly add salary schedule but we can add that after we see initial results.

Mayor Rumbold stated that we are not getting job descriptions unless we pay more which is another \$7,500.

Trustee Adams clarified that Pinnacle would be reviewing the work staff do and comparing to other municipalities and then determining what is the going rate. The goal is to reach a competitive salary to hire and retain qualified personnel, keep wages affordable within budget constraints and reflect work load of what we are asking of our employees. The NYCOM survey was based on title which doesn't mean the same job in every location. Some are easier some are harder. This would compare the duties to determine the market value of their job. We don't have job descriptions, we use the state duties. This would ask everyone for that type of thing, asking them exactly what they do, and then basing a value on those duties.

Mayor Rumbold asked how we would know if the duties fit under their job descriptions.

Trustee Adams replied they might not. The Village Clerk may be doing more than a Clerk in another community. So we can't always go by title. If they are doing things that are expected or not expected to do we can always alter that and cross things off. It's generic so that is why we are having someone evaluate the kind of responsibility that has been put on these people and what to expect of them.

Mayor Rumbold asked where the money is coming from.

Manager Revella replied this is not budgeted so we could take it from the contingency accounts or any under spent funds.

Mayor Rumbold is not in favor of spending \$5,000 on this. We may need contingency funds especially in water sewer. She feels that the optional is more money and is of more value than the base and feels it's a waste of money and prefers to spend it elsewhere. We argued over \$500 here and \$250 there to keep the budget tight during budget sessions.

Trustee Adams stated that each year we get requests from staff that is built into the draft budget asking for more than the standard annual increase. Then we have to deliberate and decide if we can afford it. It is only for the people who ask. This way we get a starting wage for each position and be able to place a person on the schedule based on their number of years of service. With this we get an unbiased opinion, relieve any ideas or perceptions of favoritism, and it would review all employees equally not just those that asked. It would be a very fair analysis to justify a raise to the staff to not only ourselves, the staff, and those that possibly won't get a raise, and allow us to show we are being open minded and doing the best for the employees and protecting our citizens when they have to make the tax bill. She feels it would be money well spent.

Trustee Thompson stated that she recalls during budget discussions and she was under the impression it is always a controversial topic and has been a problem for years. Understands being conservative and watching every penny with unforeseen things that can happen in the Village but true fiscal responsibility would be to make sure that our employees are doing what we hired them to do and that we are paying them appropriately.

We just don't seem to have a mechanism in place to really gauge what we are doing. She feels we just use random numbers hoping it will work.

Trustee Ramos feels this is an investment in our future. We haven't done this in the past and we need to set up a base line for our employees particularly these 12 positions in question. He is all for creating some document to invest in the futures of our employees and keep them in parity to their job descriptions.

Deputy Mayor Hoffman commented that this has always been an issue and on one side we want to treat our employees fairly and on the other side we have an obligation to spend tax payer dollars wisely. Up until this suggestion we didn't really have a good option. We tried to do our best to try to look at other communities and tasked the Manager with that on top of his other responsibilities and we never got a true apple vs apples comparison; it was always a challenge. He thinks that a lot of our employees do go above and beyond and they do it for a number of reasons; some of them live here and some just have a tremendous work ethic and he feels that needs to be recognized. We do need some sort of parameters or measuring stick to demonstrate to the public and the employees. He feels it is a good investment in our future. He understands it was not budgeted for but he thinks we can find the money and we can possibly work it into the budget next year. He is highly in favor of this.

Trustee Sebring asked how long the survey will take. Would it be 2-3 months? Perhaps when we get past the New Year and we have a better idea of what we have left over to pay for this and go with this. He feels they should be compensated for the work that they do. He is suggesting holding off until at least December.

Trustee Adams replied they didn't say how long it would take, but we can find out. If we put it off we may be into the next budget season.

Mayor Rumbold stated we are always asking where the money is coming from. As important as we think this is we don't know. She just doesn't feel spending \$5,000 to make this work is worth the risk, sure we can find it but we will possibly short change something else to find it. She would think holding off for a few months wouldn't be a catastrophe. She is assuming the fees won't go up too much in a 3 month period of time so we can better plan for this.

Deputy Mayor Hoffman commented that he would hate to see Village employees short changed because of our poor planning. He looks to the Manager as he looks at the budget every day. Do you think we can find this in the budget cycle to cover this?

Manager Revella replied he knows he can find it but not sure if anything would be short changed. The last 7 years we have been lucky to not use contingency accounts. We may be overpaying people and save money in the next budget from this analysis. Not sure if waiting a few months will be enough time as he is not sure of the length of time the process is. He has to get the budget to them by March 20<sup>th</sup> and can adjust it until the Board adopts it.

Deputy Mayor Hoffman feels that he needs to have enough time to build the budget and if the results determine you need policy reviews from this Board. He feel in order to hit the deadlines required we need to do this sooner than later.

Trustee Adams made the motion to award the salary survey bid for the base amount of \$5,000 to Pinnacle Human Resources LLC. Seconded by Trustee Ramos. 6 ayes, 1 nay (Mayor Rumbold), 0 abstentions. Motion carried.

Manager Revella will reach out to the company and find out the time frame and discuss the other concerns of the Board and let the Board know the outcome.

### **Naming of Bradley Park Entrance Road**

Manager Revella explained we had an idea from Trustee Ramos regarding the entrance road at Bradley Park that does not have a name and giving that our National Night Out occurs there felt it fitting to have it named after our fallen Officer Dustin James. Trustee Ramos has spoken with the family who have also agreed.

Trustee Ramos made a motion to rename the Bradley Park entrance road Officer Dustin James Way and to set the naming dedication ceremony for Saturday, September 16, 2017 at 4pm at Bradley Park. Seconded by Trustee Moore. All ayes. Motion carried.

### **Fluoride Discussion**

Manager Revella first wanted to make sure everyone received the letter that was just handed to us tonight from the Health Department in addition to the information that was in the packet in response to our request so far. We were given guidelines on what it would take if the Board were to choose to remove fluoride from the water. The state passed a law in 2015 that requires a process be taken and this is part of that process in order to determine if it was possible and feasible if we wanted to remove fluoride from our water. We sent out requests to multiple medial professionals including Orange County and State Department of Health to see if they can give us any opinion or guidance on whether or not to continue water fluoridation.

Eli N. Avila, MD, JD, MPH, FCLM the Commissioner for the Orange County Department of Health stated that he spoke with the state who is concerned with the proposal to remove of the fluoridation from the water. They referred to the process, the law that was adopted in 2015 as previously stated, and they expressed to him that they will be visiting to share their thoughts on it. He has two of his engineers here this evening as well and we are here to answer any questions. We have already stated along with the CDC and most physicians and public health experts that believe that public water fluoridation does good at the levels which they are maintained. There are many studies that are out there and there may be some that are called cross sectional but they are valid studies that allow other studies to be suggestive but there is no way to draw conclusions that the fluoridation is bad. One study referred to was done with a professor he trained with Dr. Philip J Landrigan at Mt. Sinai in New York City. He is famous because he addressed that children should only be exposed to low levels, not low enough in our opinion, but addressed to Congress and also a pressing study that referred to his study about children in China and fluoride in the water affecting their IQs. Levels are so low in the United States definitely not affecting them here. The EPA analysis of all the studies he can present to you and will make sure you get a copy of. His former mentor was there and the EPA decided to decline the petition made a few years ago on a general consensus that adding fluoride to the water is bad because the studies were faulty and not true; the evidence does not show a correlation. He is not done reading it yet but with his training throughout the years and dealing with this in Newburgh early in his tenure in Orange County keep one thing in mind; September 5, 2017

if you remove fluoride we increase probability of cavities and there is a shift in overall health in children who cannot even afford tooth brushes and tooth paste, it will have an increase in cardiac disease or even early on dementia, that we know, it has been shown. Do we really want to set up a generation that is going to be handicapped because of the cavities? Fluoride does help with that it is shown. In fact Orange County is famous because of the Newburgh study. Our position is they should remain, that is what science shows and we are more than happy to share additional information.

Deputy Mayor Hoffman stated he appreciated that he came out tonight. His questions is about the somewhat new law which requires a consultation with the state does this presentation tonight count as that requirement or do we need to do an additional presentation in person.

Dr. Avila replied that he asked the same question. Their feeling is they are going to come down and they were vague when they wrote that in the law. He believes in complete transparency and that a public presentation should be given because he feels it is important especially when dealing with health of elderly and the very young who are the most effected with fluoride in the water. They said they would come down personally and he is strongly encouraging them to do that. Even though it doesn't say they have to come down he does expect them to come and address.

Attorney Donovan gave a little context; broadly speaking it is a 3 step process. If the Village wishes to discontinue the use the first step is to consult with health professionals which is where we are now. We solicited and received written opinions and have an open forum which is tonight for people to make their comments. If the Board determines that they are going to keep fluoride in the water then you are done. If you determine you would like to discontinue fluoridation the Board would then need to give a 90 day notice to the public of the discontinuance and the justification of said discontinuance as well as a plan of what we are going to do if fluoride is out of the water, and give the Department of Health 90 days' time to reply. After that a Public Hearing is required in order to repeal the existing Fluoridation Local Law. The Board cannot make a determination tonight.

Trustee Thompson commented that for many years we were told we need "x" level of fluoridation, then it was changed, then we are told infants should not have any. If fluoridation is so wonderful why do they keep changing it? How do we know this is the right number?

Dr. Avila replied that one of the things we do know is that fluoride has been considered one of the achievements of public health. Fine tuning it, this is what we go through, just like in life. One of the additional things in the Health Department is doing is garnishment to teach our nurses how to be trainers and teach other how to minimize the cavities. However it is not just the children, recently we have determined that as we get older we get gum disease and need the fluoridation. It's a matter of fine tuning it, best answer he can give without getting into the studies as to when it came out and the timetable of what the amount was then. In the beginning we had Fluorosis, a browning of the teeth, in the 1930s and since then it has been fine tuned. No one can argue that it has lowered the rate of cavities that can have such a detrimental for many even later on in life.

Trustee Thompson asked why we need to ingest it. Isn't topical application the best method?



Dr. Avila replied with babies that is correct. With adults he agrees also it's the intensity and the gum disease you need to do that special mouth wash for 1 minute and rinse it out another minute and then go to sleep with still some residual coating on the teeth as we get older. Babies don't need it because they are without teeth but that has been a recent change, again, that fine tuning.

Trustee Thompson commented that if the best method for dental health is from topical applications why then are we drinking it in our water.

Dr. Avila replied that is because not everyone can afford the topical applications. Studies do show that the levels are so low now it is safe, his engineers can speak to that, it is not detrimental whatsoever.

Trustee Thompson replied that there is a large group of people that disagree with that and are reputable professionals that claim their studies and information are on the money correct. How many water suppliers in Orange County are still fluoridating their water?

Dr. Avila replied that his engineers will answer that question.

Mayor Rumbold asked what programs Orange County has in place for municipalities that don't fluoridate their water.

Dr. Avila replied they don't it is up to the pediatrician to educate the parents. He grew up in New York City and when he moved up here he had to give his children a fluoride pill. He was surprised about that when he moved here. There are areas in NY where less than 30% of the population in certain counties get fluoridation and they show greater disease.

Mayor Rumbold stated that you have no program to educate communities that don't fluoridate. If you never had fluoride to begin with, do you go there and encourage them to add fluoride? And if they are not going to fluoridate do they have to provide access to fluoride at pharmacies or somewhere else?

Dr. Avila replied no. Reaching out is the responsibility of the patient-physician relationship. We do educate through radio spots or healthcare outreach, we do educate. Not just when we hear about these situations. We are actively involved in educating the public but that really falls under the purview of the individual physician and even the state that licenses the physicians and the department of education. Same situation with lead, state says to go out and we do educate at health fairs. He started a program with a Pediatrician, Dr. Clark in Albany, who started the state wide program that started with garnishment. We are not being remiss about education.

Mayor Rumbold commented that if it is only communities that have had fluoride in their community. Can you see how a community such as ours would feel that the state requirements are punitive for making that decision? Other municipalities don't have it in their water at all and they don't have any of these programs and don't have to do anything.

Dr. Avila replied if you don't have fluoride in your water you still need dental care so hopefully you would be going to a dentist hopefully on a regular basis to get that dental care. However he will venture to say that these steps for a local municipality are in  
September 5, 2017

response to the law that was passed in 1974 by 2 misguided Nassau County Legislators that said that the Department of Health could not force municipalities to have fluoride which they later regretted that past. He is guessing that's why they created that due to that regret from that law from Albany. He is speculating at that point as to why they would be so strict. Same thing occurred with as you know we all get taxed but the real essence of tax is to modify behavior. Have to make it uniform. He likes democracy and complete transparency which is how he has run his whole career. He can see how it would be viewed as punitive. He thinks Health Care should be a right.

Deputy Mayor Hoffman stated that he was part of the Board in 2013 when this was last discussed, there was a presentation jointly by the local Department of Health and the State. As a local elected official he found the presentation to be very helpful. If he could assist us to get reps from state here it would be appreciated.

Trustee Moore asked if he know how many pharmacies offered fluoride tablets free.

Dr. Avila replied he had no idea, but he doubts that they do.

Mr. Walther stated that Hannaford's in Walden does.

Trustee Thompson commented that if this is such a hot topic and children are adversely impacted because they have no access to dental care or maybe not the best nutrition. Public schools do other initiatives such as vision, hearing, scoliosis testing; why does the state not try to put something in place with the schools to do something if the dental issue is such a hot topic?

Dr. Avila replied there are recommendations about things like that but there is a lack of uniformity and school boards are strict about what they will disseminate. He has an ongoing relationship to help keep active lines of communication open to educate parents, but you have to keep after it. He has been very diligent with the Superintendents.

Trustee Thompson asked how you respond to people who feel it is a violation of their rights to be forced to ingest it.

Dr. Avila replied that the basic general public health concept is the needs of the masses vs the needs of the few. Or getting bottled water is what he's heard people say.

Attorney Donovan stated it is perfectly legal to fluoridate water. It is also perfectly legal to remove fluoride as long as you follow the process.

Meg Atwood, SUNY Orange Dental Hygiene Department, hoped the Board had the opportunity to read the information she sent them and would like to address incorrect information given tonight. Europe doesn't fluoridate their water which is true as they have less centralized drink water sources but they have many programs in place for many decades that are very effective. Salt that is ingested, they fluoridate the salt. The difference between topical and ingestion, the great thing about water fluoridation is that people don't have to know about it to benefit from it. There is a 25% reduction in decay by those people who drink fluoridated water without knowing anything across all ages and that is pretty substantial. From a fiscal perspective you talk about reducing Medicaid expenditures, insurance expenditures, and reduces days lost from work or school, which

are very great reasons to consider it from a fiscal perspective. Dental screenings are recommended and required in the schools but it is more of a voluntary thing. The problem is that the screening does nothing to the actual status of your mouth. We see it, we find it but there is no treatment or prevention of the decay they may or may not have. In children they are seeing it at a very young age which happens before the kids are in school so the decay has already happened and it has set that child up for a lifetime of dental problems, a fear of dentistry, and stress to those that cannot afford dental care. It is a huge and growing problem.

Trustee Thompson asked how that is happening if we are all fluoridating the water.

Meg replied that many things contribute to dental decay. Dietary factors, food ingestion patterns, nutrition, brushing teeth, are they using fluoride toothpaste, how often they are brushing and if they are doing it correctly. Now we have sugar and sports drinks which are increasing decay again. Fluoridation is not a cure for decay but it will reduce decay by 25% which is very substantial.

Mayor Rumbold clarified if you varnish a small child's teeth it will prevent baby bottle decay.

Meg replied absolutely.

Mayor Rumbold replied if they have poor dietary concerns, poor oral hygiene, let's not forget genetics, even if they are fluoridated does not mean you are going to prevent tooth decay as all those factors come into play.

Meg replied you are not going to totally prevent it, but you have the potential to reduce the level of tooth decay.

Mayor Rumbold agreed but the other factors are part of that as well.

Meg added that other things to think about are if you use the water, cook with it, drink from tap you will get benefit of water fluoridation and reducing your level of decay by making your teeth stronger. In children it builds stronger teeth and in people whose teeth have already developed it helps us to keep stronger teeth. It is not a cure all and there are a number of things such as many families don't know about these things, many don't practice them, they don't have toothbrushes or tooth paste, may be sharing one toothbrush for the entire family so there are multiple factors. This is one thing as a city council that you can do to help your families across all age spans. You can help the young people as well as elderly who are on fixed incomes and don't have the money for dental care. We have a community dental clinic at the college and we recommend prevention. Most of them cannot afford it. So if you are looking at ways to help your community which has a high level of poverty as you know and keeping your families healthy...

Mayor Rumbold stated she is not sure where she got that information from.

Meg replied she doesn't have the information with her but thinks it is from the free and reduce lunch program data in this community, which is well documented, but she will find it and send to you.

Meg continued directing her comment to Trustee Thompson who asked why the government has reduced its recommendation of the level of fluoride that should be added to the water. When the original recommendations were first made in the 1950s and after studies had been done we didn't have any fluoride products at all. Now we do; we have exposure to many more products now than we did then because of that exposure and some people are using more the health and human services recommended the reduction from 1.0 parts per million to 0.7 parts per million. They will evaluate that to determine if it is effective. It was done, really, to reduce the slight level of fluorosis we see which is a cosmetic condition while keeping up the health of the teeth and keeping them resistant to decay. So that addresses that question. This gentleman here stated that pediatricians do not support fluoride and that is incorrect. She sent the Board an easy to read list of organizations that recommend fluoridations. It is a list of 107 agencies including the government, not for profits, industry nationally and internationally, the Department of Defense, and other professional organizations. You can always find a person who can tell you they have research on something, on anything. These are professional organizations very well respected including the American Medical Association, including the American Academy of Pediatrics. She knows that you received letters from Crystal Run and one physician who wrote a letter was from endocrinology and two were from pediatrics. You have this wealth of information about organizations that are well respected around the world that support water fluoridation safety and efficacy and it seems you are trying to put holes in it which is mind boggling to her.

Trustee Thompson stated she did visit several of the sites she sent to the Board and most of the information is about the health of teeth. What can you tell us about the effects of fluoride on other systems of the body?

Meg replied that she can tell you that nothing has been found to date. She keeps hearing that studies have been done and the strength of those studies vs others. If the American Cancer Society felt that fluoride caused or was anyway related to cancer, do you think they would allow their name to be on this list?

Mayor Rumbold asked about the names on the list. What are they advocating? Have they conducted their own studies or are they just getting on board saying they agree with the research of others.

Meg commented that she doesn't think these organization would just get on board with anything with doing their own research. She can't speak for them. She is sure they have attorneys and researchers and scientific staff. They are on a list of national and international organizations that recognize the public health benefits to community water fluoridation of preventing decay. She also wanted to speak to you as a parent. She lives outside of Middletown in Slate Hill and when she started working with water fluoridation that Town was not yet participating yet. She wrote letters that she wrote to her pediatrician who was working on water fluoridation and she joined him. She has well water and her children took fluoride supplements and they never had decay to this point and her oldest is 26 youngest is 22. She feels they were very lucky to have a mom who is a dental hygienist and a mom who watched their every move for their dental health even though they didn't have the benefit of fluoridated water. She watched their lunch boxes, took them to regular dental checkups and made sure they had good dental hygiene. Even though her children didn't have the direct benefit of having fluoridated water they had access to prevention. She teaches in a clinic and we see hundreds of people each year, probably

September 5, 2017

closer to a thousand. When we treat the dental health of many individuals, we get to access the health of their mouth as well as their general health and she can tell those who have been raised in fluoridated water communities vs those that are not as their teeth are much healthier. Decay is very painful. Children and adults that die from decayed teeth. In communities who are not fluoridated there are more Emergency Room visits, there is data on this. These are visits to the ER for people whose dental needs cannot be met. They go to the ER because they can't get dental care. You can help; your decision can combat that across all age spans. You have that power here.

Ann of Main Street, stated she's 64 and wouldn't go near fluoride with a twenty foot pole. It is on the periodic table of elements. Chlorine and fluoride are poisonous gases. When you take a shower in fluoridated water you are not just swallowing it you are absorbing it as well. She knows what she learned in school and in college and we should be very careful with Fluoride. It is your choice. She gets spring water herself.

Cindy Bestenheider, commented that she would like the Board to vote against adding fluoride to the water. She is against adding something that is not there normally. Concerned about long term effects on thyroid and medication interaction. If people want fluoride why can't they buy it? She does not believe the argument that people can't afford to buy tooth paste and tooth brushes, they are not that expensive. It's not fair to make the rest of us to drink it if we don't want it. On another note, she does like the bicycles on Main Street and feels they are a nice unique addition to the Village this summer and hopes we can have them again or something similar next summer.

Robert Walther, commented that it was suggested that we need to fine tune fluoride but this is the only medication where one size fits all, no that is incorrect. There is no control over how much you are going to get, some drink more water and some drink less; there is no means of measuring how much anyone takes, it is just not possible. He doesn't doubt the integrity and intention to do good but that doesn't mean that they are doing good. He compared it to an advertisement that "More Camel cigarettes have been sold than others". He is being exaggerative to make a point. He really objects very strongly to the cavalier comment that for public good you have to be mass medicated.

Attorney Donovan stated that the Board should consider what they heard tonight and shouldn't take any action tonight. If the Board wishes to move forward and keep fluoride you need to do nothing. If you wish to discontinue fluoridation you need to decide that and think about if you have enough information, written and verbal, and are satisfied that you have the information to make an informed decision.

Deputy Mayor Hoffman would like to hear from the state.

Mayor Rumbold asked if what they would say would be any different than what was said tonight.

Deputy Mayor Hoffman replied he would hope so, yes. This is a serious matter and he would like as much information to make decision. He is not an expert, he is an engineer, he has done a tremendous amount of research, he is sure everyone here has, he has read everything that has been submitted but openly he would like to hear from the state professionals who deal with this on a daily basis. If we can get them to come down to spend an hour that would put his mind at ease.

Mayor Rumbold is not sure if that will tip the scale for everyone.

Attorney Donovan wanted to emphasize to the Board that they should gather information that they feel comfortable they have sufficient information from appropriate health officials to make a decision.

Mayor Rumbold stated that the Board may not even want to continue the conversation. If the Board would like to continue fluoridation, why drag the state down here if we don't need them to?

Trustee Moore stated that she has an email dated August 30<sup>th</sup> from the NYS Health Department saying they were going to sending a letter and not sure if it was going to make it in time. She wanted to make sure that what was just handed to us tonight was such letter.

Manager Revella stated that is what was told to us tonight, just prior to the meeting.

Attorney Donovan stated that if you are going to rely upon something he assumes the Board might want something on letterhead that someone signed not just something that was brought with them and handed to us tonight.

Lee Burgess, Engineer with the Orange County Department of Health, stated that in speaking with the state, his understanding is that this paper was put together as a generic document to be used by other municipalities as well. This is not specifically tailored for Walden looking to eliminate fluoridation, for any municipality.

Mayor Rumbold asked if there is more they can say that wasn't said tonight that we have a reason we should have NYS come down.

Mr. Burgess replied that they can provide more case study and detail, this is just a summary of their report.

Deputy Mayor Hoffman felt this was put together by the state in response to their 2015 public health law revisions. Does he know if this was a response specifically for Walden?

Mr. Burgess replied that this was put together at the request of our department because of circumstances in Walden as far as looking for municipalities to go to fluoridation as most don't go away from it. 70% of US residents that are on municipal water do have fluoridation. Most do not go away from it. This was unique so they prepared this to make sure it was appropriate at the various channels of the health department.

Deputy Mayor Hoffman asked if we were the first to consider this after these revisions to the law from 2015.

Mr. Burgess replied he couldn't say.

Mayor Rumbold feels the law was developed after Poughkeepsie took it out of their system and others as well.

Mr. Burgess stated that some systems have naturally occurring fluoride which comes into play as well, he can't speak for all of them. The 0.7 parts per million that is currently utilized concerns the food we eat etc. but part of that is the naturally occurring fluoride levels which is why they are finding the need to decrease the introduction of fluoride. Colorado for example has a higher level of naturally occurring fluoride than New York does but the 0.7 needs to be a total of what is naturally occurring combined with what is being added. With regards to how many water suppliers in Orange County are fluoridating he can say that we haven't lost any we have only gained. Currently the Village of Harriman has naturally occurring fluoridation, the City of Newburgh, City of Middletown, Village of Walden, Town of Newburgh, Village of Highland Falls, the Town of Highlands purchases their water from the Village of Highland Falls, and West Point also.

Mayor Rumbold finds it interesting the City of Port Jervis, a poor community, does not fluoridate their water. She asked the Board if they need to hear from NYS to move on with the process, do we need more information. Would you like more discussion on this topic?

No: Mayor Rumbold, Trustee Sebring, Trustee Moore, and Trustee Thompson.

Yes: Trustee Adams, Deputy Mayor Hoffman, and Trustee Ramos.

Mayor Rumbold suggested that we put this on the agenda for the next meeting to decide if you want additional information. She is trying to be fair to those that feel they would like more information.

Attorney Donovan stated the state is not required to be here, we are just required to give them 90 days' notice as the next step if the Board would like to discontinue. The statute doesn't say, it just says health professionals not what the consultations should consist of or whether they are verbal or written. He would think you would want a reliable written opinion from someone who is qualified to recommend the removal of fluoride from the water that you can rely upon to make this determination. If the Board is satisfied that you have that information then you can move forward.

Mayor Rumbold just wants to make sure we are meeting the criteria of the NYS threshold. Last thing she wants to hear is that we move forward and then find out that we didn't meet the criteria.

Dr. Avila clarified that we would still need to give a 90 day notice to the Health Department and then they may come back and say they want to meet with you.

Mayor Rumbold asked to have this continued on the agenda for next time and asked the Board to think about it.

### **Revised Capital Projects 2017-2018**

Manager Revella explained that we would like to confirm what the Board has already approved through the Bond resolution the addition of the petroleum storage facility of \$67,000 included in the list of capital projects for 2017-2018 budget. It is for above ground tanks, we have no buried tanks. This one would have about the same capacity as what we have. It could be more or less depending on the results of the bid.

Trustee Sebring asked about the diesel trucks, who checks the additive for the emissions, the mechanic or the driver.

Manager Revella confirmed the drivers check those. The permit we have is for what we have now, no changes to storage.

Trustee Adams made a motion to adopt the Revised Capital Projects list for the 2017-2018 budget. Seconded by Trustee Sebring. All ayes. Motion carried.

**Resolution 8-17-18: Budget modification**

Manager Revella explained this is for the Recreation & Parks Department due to the Summer Camp having more expenses due to increased attendance. This will balance that out now that the program is over.

Trustee Adams made a motion to approve Resolution 8-17-18: Budget modification. Seconded by Trustee Ramos. All ayes. Motion carried.

**Public Comment**

Anita Vandermark, 76 Highland Avenue, thanked Tara Bliss and her volunteers for tying the ribbons around the trees in the Square and on Main Street. She always goes above and beyond with everything that she does and she should get that recognition. The bikes just so everyone knows will be disappearing to make way for the Harvest Fest decorations. There will be a Harvest Fest store front decorating competition too. There was a party at the teen center and it was cleaned up the carpet came out but it needs to be replaced as the floor is slippery without it. She would like to see that happen before there is an accident.

Becky McNally, 52 Oakland Avenue, complimented the ribbon tying, it is a great addition. She also complimented the Recreation Department for the wonderful summer program. The counselors down there were so thoughtful and such a thorough program. She saw it all first-hand and we should be very proud of what they accomplished. Thanked the Village Manager and whomever for spraying the weeds on Main Street. Too bad we couldn't come around the corner on Route 208. Some of the holes have weeds that are about 24" or so high, maybe we can spray them but maybe we can weed whack them or something as the residents don't accept the responsibility. It seems they do their lawn but not the grass between the sidewalk and the street and it looks a mess. A few times a week she has occasion to go down to the Wooster Grove Gym and Anita is correct about the rug as having nothing there is terrible. Please replace it.

Mayor Rumbold stated that it did get thrown out because it had to be and was dangerous.

**Payment of the Audited Bills**

Trustee Adams made a motion to pay the audited bills. Seconded by Trustee Moore. All ayes. Motion carried.

**Correspondence**

Trustee Thompson receive a letter from Anna Berrian and read it into the minutes regarding trees at 31 Bank Street causing damages to her home at 33 Bank Street. The Village Manager to respond.



Everyone got an invitation from Shoprite regarding bagging day on September 20<sup>th</sup> looking for volunteers for an hour each throughout the day. Contact the Clerk if you want to attend.

### **Miscellaneous Comments from the Board of Trustees**

Trustee Moore asked if we could do a scarecrow decorating contest on the light posts in honor of Harvest Fest.

Manager Revella replied the Village will put out the hay bales and flower to decorate like we usually do.

Trustee Adams attended the Association of Towns, Villages, and Cities meeting on August 29<sup>th</sup> with Trustee Thompson and Deputy Mayor Hoffman. Orange County Tourism was there and she commended Susan on her speech via email which was great in the sense that she included Walden. It was hard to hear as many people were talking and a train went by. The Office of Retirement reported that contributions will go down almost a whole percent in 2018-2019, so that's a plus as that is a lot of money.

Mayor Rumbold commended the Recreation and Parks Department for their summer program as it was absolutely fabulous. The picnic was great, the kids had a great time and she went around and thanked as many counselors as possible. Music in the Grove was truly fabulous this year with big crowds and big thanks to Hannaford for the refreshments. She agrees with Anita about the rug at Wooster. She also noticed on the floor there is gum all over the place, can that be removed?

Manager Revella stated that is hard to remove without ruining the floor but we will see what we can do.

**Village of Walden Board of Trustees  
Regular Meeting  
September 5, 2017  
Motions & Resolutions**

**Approval of August 8, 2017 Minutes**

Trustee Adams made a motion to approve the August 8, 2017 minutes. Seconded by Trustee Ramos. All ayes. Motion carried.

**Resolution 6-17-18: 5 Cherry Street**

Trustee Sebring made the motion to adopt Resolution 6-17-18 – Sale of 5 Cherry Street. Seconded by Trustee Ramos. All ayes. Motion carried

**Resolution 7-17-18: DASNY Funding**

Trustee Sebring made the motion for Negative Declaration under SEQRA for Resolution 7-17-18: DASNY Funding. Seconded by Trustee Ramos. All ayes. Motion carried.

Trustee Sebring made the motion to adopt Resolution 7-17-18: DASNY Funding. Seconded by Trustee Moore. All ayes. Motion carried

**Award Bid – Salary Survey**

Trustee Adams made the motion to award the salary survey bid for the base amount of \$5,000 to Pinnacle Human Resources LLC. Seconded by Trustee Ramos. 6 ayes, 1 nay (Mayor Rumbold), 0 abstentions. Motion carried.

**Naming of Bradley Park Entrance Road**

Trustee Ramos made a motion to rename the Bradley Park entrance road Officer Dustin James Way and to set the naming dedication ceremony for Saturday, September 16, 2017 at 4pm at Bradley Park. Seconded by Trustee Moore. All ayes. Motion carried.

**Revised Capital Projects 2017-2018**

Trustee Adams made a motion to adopt the Revised Capital Projects list for the 2017-2018 budget. Seconded by Trustee Sebring. All ayes. Motion carried.

**Resolution 8-17-18: Budget modification**

Trustee Adams made a motion to approve Resolution 8-17-18: Budget modification. Seconded by Trustee Ramos. All ayes. Motion carried.

**Payment of the Audited Bills**

Trustee Adams made a motion to pay the audited bills. Seconded by Trustee Moore. All ayes. Motion carried.